



## **SPECIAL COMMISSION ON FUTURES**

(Meeting on December 6, 2022)

(The Vice President for the Latin American and Caribbean Region of the World Bank, Mr. Carlos Felipe Jaramillo and other guests)

**MR. PRESIDENT (Rodrigo Goñi Reyes).**-If there is a quorum, the meeting is open.

(It's 8:05)

— The Parliament's Special Committee on Futures welcomes our repeat visitors, the resident representative in Uruguay, Ms. Celia Ortega. We would like to say that the World Bank has been working, participating and collaborating in this process that we started in 2020. We also welcome the Vice President for the Latin American and Caribbean Region of the World Bank, Mr. Carlos Felipe Jaramillo; the Vice President for the Latin American and Caribbean Region and Senior Operations Officer, Ms. Emmy Yokoyama; the Director for Argentina, Paraguay and Uruguay, Mr. Jordan Schwartz; the leader of the Sustainable Development program, Mr. Frank Fragano; the External Affairs Officer, Ms. Valeria Bolla; the methodological advisor of the Special Committee on Futures, Ms. Lidya Garrido Luzardo; and the President of the Regulatory Unit for Communication Services and the National Council for Innovation, Science and Technology, Ms. Mercedes Aramendía.

Also participating via Zoom is economist Paula Garda, one of the experts who is working with this Commission.

As always, all parties are represented. We give the Welcome to Senator Carmen Sanguinetti, from the Colorado Party and member of the governing coalition; to Deputies Felipe Carballo and Gustavo Olmos, from the Frente Amplio; to Deputy Sebastián Cal, from Cabildo Abierto; to Deputies Gabriel Gianoli and Martín Melazzi, from the governing coalition, as well as to the other legislators who will be joining this meeting.

First of all, beyond welcoming you, we want to mention that This Futures Commission began its work in 2020, taking successful models of parliamentary Futures commissions. We began work with our methodological advisor from the UNESCO Chair, Ms. Lidya Garrido. We also had the support of Ms. Inés Fynn, who together with the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) have also been working with us from the beginning.

Our objective has been to carry out a collective intelligence process to We must approach this from a future perspective, from a model of responsible anticipation. When we approved the law in 2017 with the consensus of all political parties, these were terms that were rarely seen; now we see with satisfaction that there is hardly any document that does not mention anticipatory governance. It is with this objective and on this basis that we approved by law, in 2017, the creation of this space. It is a space that when it was launched in 2020 invited legislators or, in some way, we agreed to integrate it with legislators who shared this vision that the law had approved.

Key to the future, anticipation, collective intelligence, collaboration to address We know that these are very complex issues that we know cannot be addressed in the same way that we used to. To do this, we have permanently integrated a group of experts from different fields of knowledge, mainly from science and technology. We have received the permanent contribution of more than one hundred top-level experts. In that first publication that we made, you can see that in all areas we tried to make an overview of the main challenges that we had as Uruguay - and that, of course, any country in the world has -: bringing the future to the present, which in some way marked the agenda and we started this year with the work of the future and the future of work.

There we also received a very valuable contribution from the World Bank. We have to I must say that it was received in the same way that we were receiving contributions from other institutions or from the experts who accompany us. We also raised some issues, some needs, which require studies, so we are grateful for the generosity of the bank, which presented to the Futures Commission what was the main demand or most urgent need for this process. Methodologically, at the beginning we had the need to consult civil society; a contribution that was extremely useful. As we always say, in addition to addressing, understanding and comprehending the main challenges - which already has a value *per se*-, It is very difficult for Parliament to address digital transformation or anything related to the future of work if it does not understand where the trends and emerging issues are coming from.

So first of all, we must understand and naturally - as always We are not here to make predictions about the future, but to act in the present based on what we see. The idea is that this Parliament, in its parliamentary role, will also confirm the need for rules, since the ones we see here are not easy and are being discussed in the world, but we will make them concrete.

We are very satisfied with how we have been working. Proof of That is because in the first *Summit* Uruguay was chosen by consensus to host the World Parliament of Futures next year. This was not a coincidence, because naturally the future commissions that have been working - to put it in some way - are jealous that the methodology followed is adequate. Improvisation does not apply here, because it could do much more damage than not doing so. Therefore, those of us who call ourselves Committees of Future Parliamentarians follow the same

methodology to address the major issues. We also started with a common language when we made our presentation in Finland. That is why we are all following the same line that allows us to collaborate among all the parliaments, because the issues are the same. We have already begun to do this collaboration with other countries around the world, which we have committed to internally and which is absolutely necessary to work on collective intelligence.

Another side effect of this very current phenomenon of polarization is the limiting effect or the impossibility of addressing these issues. If one is shooting at each other all day, it will be difficult to talk about the medium and long term, or about issues that require openness, dialogue, exchange or concessions that are very difficult to achieve. This Commission has also been doing that, since it is a space recognized by the rest of Parliament as that space for addressing issues that are medium and long term.

Furthermore, as emerges from the documents we have approved, there is a focus. We are concerned about how to address these issues in order to remain integrated into the world, and also about the threats, which range from climate threats, i.e. environmental threats, to the issue of inequality. If these challenges and threats are not addressed in spaces like this, they will undoubtedly and inexorably worsen.

With these brushstrokes we wanted to make a very brief presentation. We have many expectations, even at the level of the Inter-Parliamentary Union, since they have put on the agenda the *Summit*, which we are going to develop.

In addition, with great expectation we receive invitations every day for. We are beginning to share our experience, just like Parlatino, which asked us to take charge of the future studies area of the academy that will be launched in 2023 and will be run by our school of government. I believe that it is the first parliamentary school of government in the world that has begun capacity building. We are very clear that it is essential to train ourselves in the capacities and competencies of anticipation, since they are not learned overnight. Ms. Lidya Garrido leads this process. Parlatino also asked us to help in the creation of a space like this at the Latin American level next February.

Therefore, each one in his party and in his current policy, we have several tasks without ceasing to be involved in the daily firefights that are also part of the matter, with this commitment that this space is also parliamentary, that it has a function that we are verifying and confirming and that is of enormous utility. As legislators, who every five years have to propose ourselves to the citizens, we trust that they will also recognize in this work the usefulness and convenience of these legislators continuing in their places to occupy these spaces.

Without further ado, we give the floor to Mr. Jaramillo.

**MR. JARAMILLO (Carlos Felipe).** -Good morning and thank you very much.

It is a great pleasure for me and the World Bank team to be here. I would like to meet you in the Uruguayan Parliament. It is truly an honour, as we rarely have the opportunity to visit parliaments. I was very struck by this when I heard about the creation of this Commission and its work on the future, and particularly in relation to the jobs of the future, which is a concern that we share throughout Latin America and the entire world since certain worrying trends began to be noticed regarding how the world of work is changing as a result of major technological changes. For this reason, I asked Ms. Celia Ortega to contact the Commission in order to make a visit and greet them.

We really come to listen and learn from you about the methodology, about what they are anticipating and how they operate, because we would very much like - and it is part of the nature of the World Bank - to bring good experiences from one country to another.

Finally, I want to tell you that the World Bank is an entity that apart from its financial arm of providing loans and financial support to countries, mainly through the Ministries of Finance and Economy, it has a very large component of studies and technicians dedicated to the most pressing problems in the countries. For this issue of future employment we have a multidisciplinary group that has been working for several years, producing some documents, *some paper*, We hope you have received them. If not, we will send you the latest information we have at a global level and for some countries in particular, with the advantage that it is a group that not only has conceptual experts who know the subject well, but who are also continually interacting with our teams in each country. We are present in approximately one hundred and twenty countries. At the World Bank we are a little more than one hundred and ninety member countries, but we act by helping countries that are still clients of the World Bank, because they require technical or financial support in approximately one hundred and twenty countries. We have that constant interaction, as well as offices in all these countries.

In turn, we learn a lot from the things that happen. Uruguay has always been a country from which the Bank has learned a lot, because it is one of the most advanced countries - at least in Latin America and in general among all the Bank's members who are clients - that is facing fourth-generation problems. These are more novel problems. That is why we are so interested in listening to and learning from you.

Thank you so much.

**SENATOR NANE VINCON (Silvia).** -Good morning everyone.

I wrote down some things so we can reflect together and see the possibility. to find opportunities to work together.

I want to make a very brief introduction. Uruguay is one of the many countries Latin America has a fairly primary economy. That is where I think we can start working, even more so in the context of where we come from, such as the growing commodification of knowledge and production. I think that what sometimes happens to us is that - as Rodrigo Goñi said - parliaments in particular and states in general always end up legislating, regulating or issuing regulations in a reactive way. We want to change that way of proceeding in order to be able to address issues of anticipatory governance.

Furthermore, as Rodrigo Goñi said, anticipatory governance requires trying to look beyond the current situation, at what the particular situations are. For that to ultimately make sense and permeate towards people's participation - which is, ultimately, what will sustain it in the long term - in addition to doing things well, there needs to be good communication. I think the pandemic taught us a lot in that sense, since we all ended up talking about RNA and a lot of things that we didn't know about precisely because science had to come into the field of social participation because there were no vaccines and there was no trust. Therefore, communication is one of the ways of generating trust.

When we were at the summit in Finland and Sweden, one of the things What caught my attention the most was that there were several companies that had their business objectives based on science that the United Nations had created. They took that as a way of measuring themselves, not only against business objectives, but also against objectives that transcended us as a global community. When one achieves trust based on those indicators that are important to all of us, I believe that this percentage of trust and participation is achieved that sustains much more than political agreements in the medium and long term, since political agreements are sustained over time, but social agreements are much more permanent since they are, ultimately, those that generate community ties.

There is a learning process between seeing where we are going and being able to go. supporting it with indicators. That is a leg that I find very interesting and that can be worked on, that is, in the generation of impact indicators for both regulations and public policies, understanding that this is helping us get to where we want to go.

Finally, I want to bring up in terms of what it has to do with the work of the future and the future of work - which we have been discussing with Celia Ortega - that there is a very interesting opportunity for work in relation to care. You know better than us all that dynamic; there is an important dynamic in which women take more participation in the labor market, but that is impossible if we do not advance in care policies. These policies are, in turn, if we look at it in a circular way, a job opportunity for a lot of people. In addition, there are aspects such as technology - thinking about 5G -, without leaving aside, among many things, what we owe ourselves as a community: care. If we manage to integrate that, opportunities can be developed. Celia knows that that part has me

I am concerned and busy, because I think there is a very interesting opportunity, not only to incorporate women into the labor market but also to allow other women to join and to be able to arrive at regulations that need an important impact study and an economic study, since we can begin to test aspects such as, for example, parental leave. That requires an impact analysis to see how we are in the care system, not only in the formal aspect but in the implementation. Therefore, we need to have elements of a more comprehensive social security policy than the one we have. That would be important, there are several things to take into account.

Specifically, there are two aspects: on the one hand, trying to define indicators of future policies and possible regulations to generate samples of where we are going and, on the other hand, what has to do with the proposed economy, with care, or whatever we want to call it. I think these are two interesting points to work on.

Thank you so much.

**SENATOR SANGUINETTI (Carmen).** -We welcome the delegation. It is a pleasure for us to be sharing this morning with you.

I would like to make a few comments.

As Deputy Goñi said, this Commission has a methodology, a very specific and well-defined objective. I think we must not forget that as a Committee on Futures we have this conviction of helping to bring the future to the present, to the whole Parliament, to the way we work here. Some of us are quite critical in relation to the methodology, to the role of the advisors.

I think the Futures Commission is being a beacon in what has to do with with the synergies between the advisors and the legislators. Undoubtedly, Uruguay has many professionals, academics of great prominence at national and international level and, in that sense, this Commission has been a balm of synergies. For us it has been a pleasure to have the possibility of having these exchanges on a monthly basis throughout the year. Perhaps, there are opportunities to replicate this to other commissions, both the synergy between the legislators with the advisors as well as the synergies at international level.

In Finland it was suggested that it is very good that all legislators We are together and we can exchange ideas. I was suggesting, why not, to think about capitalising on and somehow deepening that synergy between the advisors and you, who, as a bank, have offices in one hundred and twenty countries. Without a doubt, you can be a vehicle to facilitate this.

In relation to the future of work, I share some of the concerns or concerns that Senator Nane mentioned.

Specifically, as regards the reintegration of women I find a very significant job opportunity in our country. As you know, there are many women who at some point in their career leave the system, the world of work, either because of the birth of a certain number of children, the birth of a child with a disability, or for a variety of reasons.

As we well know, there are many countries that are examples in the policies of women's reintegration into the workforce. In this regard, Uruguay is lagging behind and we cannot ignore that, given the scale of our country, it would be interesting to approve some regulations to eventually replicate.

I simply want to thank everyone for their participation and express my gratitude. enthusiasm to continue to delve deeper and work on these issues.

Thank you so much.

**MR. PRESIDENT.** -We give the floor to Lydia Garrido, who is part of the UNESCO Chair in Anticipation and Futures, participates in many futures spaces and has been of enormous value in getting us started in this process.

**MRS. GARRIDO LUZARDO (Lydia).** -Good morning everyone.

Thank you very much President, Vice President, members of the Commission of The World Bank delegation is already in the future. It has really been and continues to be a pleasure to work together, to put collective intelligence into practice.

As I say, one thing is to use words and another thing is to put them into practice.

Uruguay's experience with the Futures Commission is doubly innovative: on the one hand, due to this new way of placing ourselves in the processes of knowledge creation, in an inter and transdisciplinary way and, on the other, by seeking to bring the future to the present.

This Commission aims to work on capabilities and competencies I think that one ambition is to take it to the social broad. Although this is nourished by experts in various areas, the issue is to understand the plurality of knowledge, of wisdom and that we need methodologies. That is where the importance of the method and the approaches lies so that this can be possible.

We are suffering what at one point meant a great progress, this division of knowledge into parcels that we have inherited from the 19th and 20th centuries. The current context in which we live places us in need of a paradigmatic leap, of learning to look at problems in a different way, and for that, inter and transdisciplinarity, collective intelligence, and the co-creation of knowledge are key aspects.

As for the technical issue as it relates to futures, this is a commission that is not limited exclusively to the exercise of prospective studies such as, for example, scenarios for 2030, 2040, 2050. In other words, that information is there, it is being produced, but what matters is how it can help decision-makers - in this case, the parliamentarians - to orient themselves in the present and to expand the alternatives, not only in quantity but also in quality, that is, not having many alternatives of more of the same, but different alternatives that allow us to make sense of what is new and emerging.

To use the example that Senator Silvia Nane used, I think this is what that Covid has brought us. Beyond all the misfortunes and everything we have had to regret, it has also been a learning opportunity. That is why it is important to deal not only with what is known - from the past, often reactive - but also with what is unknown. It is in novelty that there are opportunities.

To close my intervention, I would like to say that through the various experts and collaborators have links with different networks, including the Millennium Project - a goal so global that it is present in more than eighty countries and of which I have the privilege of being the coordinator here in Uruguay -, the network of UNESCO Chairs in Anticipation and Futures and other foresight networks at the Latin American level.

**MR. PRESIDENT.** -We now give the floor to Dr. Mercedes Aramendía, one of the experts who is with us. She is not only the president of the Communications Services Regulatory Unit, but also the president of Conicyt (National Council for Innovation, Science and Technology of Uruguay), which brings together all public and private actors.

It is a privilege to have Mercedes. We asked her for a brief reflection on what we are doing to know your vision.

**MRS. ARAMENDIA (Mercedes).** -Good morning to everyone. Thank you very much for the invitation. It is a pleasure for me to be with you. I apologize for not being able to be there from the beginning, but I had other commitments that I could not postpone.

Integrate the Parliament's Futures Commission, as part of the commission of experts, it has not only been an honour but also a source of pride that has allowed us to actively contribute from different perspectives, forcing us - as Lydia said - to bring the future to the present and complementing each other in the different visions. Without a doubt, the work has been very rich.

When we gather together the various experts that we have the possibility to Being in the Commission, we see the various analyses that the Futures Commission has carried out, the lines of work that it has followed, that it has been carrying out over time, and we listen to the different perspectives. We all have different backgrounds and we are enriched by the diversity of visions. I think that this is something very



important because, without a doubt, diversity is essential to be able to build proactively; we have to be able to integrate variety, which is what enriches us.

Upon arrival I had the opportunity to listen to Senator Nane who was doing reference to what social agreements are and their importance, as well as the importance of indicators. In general, this is an aspect that I really like to highlight: the importance and the need to work on a culture. I think that for this, it is key to build on the basis of social agreements, pacts, alliances, which go beyond a moment and partisan issues. It is essential to seek long-term national policies so that, precisely, the country as a whole can advance both in social and cultural issues, as well as in economic and social development and well-being.

Regarding the indicators, since 2020 we have been working on the Conicyt (National Council for Innovation, Science and Technology) in the evaluation of the National Strategic Plan for Science, Technology and Innovation.

The Pencti, as it is called, was approved in 2010. It is a very Well, at the time, it outlined the needs that the country had in 2010 to advance in the development of science, technology and innovation. Although it is a very good plan - today the mission and vision are fully shared - one of the major flaws we found is that we lacked indicators. Why are indicators so important? Because they allow us to measure, control and do self-criticism in order to improve. That is why, at Conicyt we have been working these last two years to evaluate the plan.

In this regard, we held several workshops, a consultancy was hired - whose work has already been published - and then, based on those inputs that were generated, the Council itself made a report that we approved yesterday and that we will soon be publishing in our *web*It is a very critical report. We tried to do a SWOT analysis to find out what the strengths, opportunities, weaknesses and threats were within Pencti, in order to learn from what these past twelve years were like in order to start working on a new Pencti.

One of the main aspects that was highlighted was the need to search indicators that allow us to measure, control and make an evaluation in short or medium periods, in order to evolve, because everything is changing more and more quickly, social needs are changing and it is important that we respond accordingly.

I will also refer to something that the senator mentioned. Sanguinetti on the importance of generating work throughout the ecosystem. The work of Parliament is fundamental, and can be done from the Executive Branch, from academia, from civil associations; I do not want to leave anyone out of the ecosystem. Precisely, one of the very positive aspects of Conicyt is its integration: there are representatives from the Executive Branch, from State entities, from the Congress of Mayors, from the National Public Education Administration (ANEP),

from the University of the Republic, from private universities, from the PIT-CNT, representatives of workers, of the productive sector, of the national system of researchers. Without a doubt, when we do an analysis or are working, we see how the different visions and perspectives are integrated, allowing us to arrive at more complete and comprehensive analyses.

As Lydia said, I think it is important and fundamental to highlight the importance of seeking coordinating roles from different perspectives, integrating them with clear objectives, seeing how we can all work together to bring the future to the present. I am sure that there are no unique models, but it depends on the context and reality of each country and each situation, as well as on the objectives that are set. For this, it is key to establish agendas, goals, indicators.

To conclude, I would like to say that the Executive Branch, the Ministry of Education and Culture, has announced that it plans to work on a new Pencti. The idea is to begin this year, taking into account what has been learned in these twelve years with the previous Pencti, as well as the input that has been gathered through these various workshops, consultancies and reports to work on a new plan that will allow us all to move forward together in search of a national policy.

I also find it interesting to note that last week it was announced from the Ministry of Education and Culture, who were working on consultancies to address the institutional redesign of science, technology and innovation. In fact, several legislators present here were accompanying us. It is essential that the different roles with their diverse perspectives be integrated in order to achieve a better result.

I would like to especially thank you for this opportunity, which is fundamental for what which is the joint development of our country

I remain available for any assistance I may have.

Thank you so much.

**MR. PRESIDENT.** -We are very excited about this process.

Most of us have held executive positions in different parties; half are opposition and half are from this government, but the opposition was government in the previous period.

We are convinced to start this process here, in Parliament. Why? As you know - the World Bank has done it and the Executives too - representatives of the citizens must participate and get involved in these processes, as they are the ones who generally execute, implement, legislate, at least in the medium and not to mention in the long term.

They do very beautiful work. I have seen work that is really beautiful. We are reading them, and we are very educated, but we parliamentarians have the obligation and the duty to explain what is happening in today's politics. We, as well as the Minister of Industry, Energy and Mining and the President of Conicyt, can be very clear about the climatic, environmental and technological challenges, but the citizens must also be clear about them. Above all, in countries like ours that continue to be very parliament-centric. Most of the press is here; as always, the press will interview the government and the opposition. So, the citizens know that the voices and the issues are being discussed for a reason. That is why we insist. It is an effort; it is a challenge.

In fifteen minutes the senators have a Senate session, in recent days of the year, and we deputies have several rules to specify and discuss in the last two weeks, but we know that this space is worthwhile and is an effort. That is why we ask for your help. There are many things in which institutions such as the World Bank can help us and collaborate. As we have shown, these are efforts that are efficient and effective. That is what we wanted to convey.

In a few moments the delegation has a meeting with the vice president who, As he presides over the Senate session, his minutes are numbered.

**MR. JARAMILLO (Carlos Felipe).** -We thank you for the time you have given us. It is very interesting and I think it meets my expectations of a very special place in this Parliament, thinking beyond the present to some of the biggest challenges not only in the region, but throughout the world. I congratulate you on this work.

From now on, I want to make available all the knowledge and support that the World Bank can provide, whether on country-specific, regional or global experiences. You can count on us to help you in this endeavor.

Precisely, at the Board of Directors of the World Bank in Washington, today it was The World Bank discusses the World Bank's support strategy for Uruguay for the next five years. It explains the country's situation and the challenges it is facing. The Bank is going to be acting along a couple of lines, especially on issues related to the challenges of climate change, which are reflected here in various ways, including the issue of agriculture, livestock, water and issues related to what we were talking about, such as employment, the work of the future and how to help Uruguay so that it can face this challenge of training, of developing the skills required for the future, both for young people and for those who have faced difficulties with entering a different labor market, which continues to transform and change. These are the two major lines of action on which we are going to be working in the next five years. That was briefly what I wanted to say.

I really appreciate your time and I hope we can continue developing this collaboration.

Thank you.

**MR. PRESIDENT.** -Finally, on behalf of the entire Commission and Parliament, we would like to thank the World Bank representative for her collaboration and involvement, as she has participated and come to this Parliament several times.

I want to emphasize that Celia Ortega asked us what we needed, she did not say that had something to offer us. In fact, what we asked the World Bank for was what we needed at that time. It was an important job, with an economic cost, which was extremely useful for us. In addition, it also allowed us to participate in the formulation of the work that was requested.

For us that was very important, because as a Parliament it is very different - you know this - when the World Bank comes and brings us something - we would also have to explain to the other parliamentarians why the World Bank brought us this work or this report - than when we can convey - as we have conveyed to the other parliamentarians - that we asked the World Bank for this work and that we participated in the sub-design. We ask them to continue doing so.

We thank you all for coming here today.

There being no further business, the meeting is adjourned.

(It is 8:55)

---

Montevideo, Uruguay. Legislative Branch.